

THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING WAS HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL ON THURSDAY, JUNE 30, 2011.

ROLL CALL: PRESENT: C. Cohen, M. Gorden, J. Greenberg,
R. Hecht, B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell
ABSENT: None
ALSO PRESENT: W. Griswold, T. Kreczko,
R. Schaltenbrand, G. Smerigan

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by C. Cohen to approve the minutes of the May 26, 2011 regular meeting.

ROLL CALL: AYES: C. Cohen, M. Gorden, J. Greenberg,
R. Hecht, B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell
NAYS: None
MINUTES APPROVED

COUNCIL REPORT

Mr. Mark Wachter, Council Representative, stated that the Planning and Zoning Commission had recommended to City Council P&Z 2011-10, the lot consolidation of two parcels for the proposed Social Security Administration Building located at 3589 Park East Drive, and this item was approved.

P&Z 2011-13 FAHRINGER, MCCARTY, GREY, INC., LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS & ENGINEERS, REPRESENTING DOLLAR BANK, FSB, LOCATED AT 26949 CHAGRIN BLVD. IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL APPROVAL FOR SITE PLAN IMPROVEMENTS.

Mr. Jeffrey Kahn, President of NAI Daus Commercial Brokerage, introduced Mr. David Brooks, with Fahringer, McCarty, Grey, Inc., a landscape architect and engineering firm located in Pennsylvania, and Mr. Bert Brooks, Manager of Corporate Real Estate for Dollar Bank. Mr. Kahn indicated that Dollar Bank is very pleased to have acquired this banking location in Beachwood after many years of searching for a site within the City. Mr. Kahn provided an overview of the project and advised that the proposed banking facility will include a full-service retail branch, as well as a private banking office with approximately twelve (12) employees.

Mr. David Brooks than presented a detailed description of the proposed site plan. Mr. Brook stated that the existing building is three stories with the main entrance on Chagrin Boulevard and a secondary entrance in the rear. The parking lot currently has 137 parking spaces and Dollar Bank plans on occupying the first floor of the existing building. To the rear or northwest side of the building will be a private banking service and southwest there will be a full-service retail portion of the bank. There will be a new building entrance and a two-lane drive-thru with a canopy and an ATM. It is necessary to reconfigure some of the parking in order to accommodate the drive-thru and the canopy. The reconfigured parking spaces will be relocated near the entrances. Five new spaces will be near the crosswalks, three spaces relocated to the secondary entrance at the rear of the building, and two new handicapped parking spaces will be at the main entrance.

Mr. Brooks also indicated that the improvements will include a canopy over the drive-thru, a new vestibule and a redesign of the stairway at the rear of the building. Exterior improvements include new sidewalks, the repair of pavement, new site lighting, including bases and poles, and landscaping improvements.

Mr. Griswold stated the Fire Department, the Police Department and the Building Department have no questions or comments and recommend approval. Mr. Griswold did indicate that there were questions regarding the drive-thru operations and the parking to the southwest of the private banking entry, (one handicapped space and three regular parking spaces). However, Mr. Griswold indicated that the Police Chief did not foresee any problems as the parking spaces in question are designated for Dollar Bank employee parking.

Mr. Kreczko stated that there are several minor engineering comments for the applicant to address and would recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated the this request is for preliminary and final site plan approval for the addition of a drive-thru window, modifications to the parking lot, landscaping improvements, and new site lighting and signage. The site contains an existing three (3) story office building. Dollar Bank presently occupies the ground floor of the building with office tenants on the second and third floors. The site is adjacent to the Chagrin Boulevard/I-271 interchange, with the western boundary of the site abutting the northbound on-ramp. Access to the subject site is via a shared access easement with the adjoining property which is in Woodmere. There is no drive access directly to Chagrin Boulevard from the subject site in Beachwood.

Although the site is being reconfigured with regard to traffic patterns and parking orientation, the total number of parking spaces will remain the same. There are currently 137 paved parking spaces on the site. Based upon the current mixed-use occupancy of the site with banks and offices, the total required parking is 167 spaces. Since the site was previously approved with 137 spaces and there are no changes to the uses or total number of parking spaces, no additional variances are required. Similarly, the existing building was previously authorized at its present location so no new variances are required for the side yard setback. The new traffic pattern anticipates an ATM on the east side of the building and a two (2) lane drive-thru facility on the west side of the building. A new canopy will extend over the drive-thru.

The applicant has provided a site lighting plan with photometrics. The lumen levels comply with City standards regarding light spillage. This site is impacted by the higher intensity illumination from the interstate lighting.

The proposed landscaping includes a mixture of trees and shrubs in the new foundation beds with trees in the new parking lot islands. Existing perimeter trees are to remain.

Mr. Smerigan stated that approval of the proposed site plan is recommended subject to the comments of the City Engineer.

Mr. Wachter inquired about whether with the reconfiguration of the driveways on the site, could the slope on the apron be reduced and could the drains be improved.

The applicant's representatives indicated that they would look into the problems with the trench drains and the grade of the driveway. They also indicated that the plan is to repair and possibly lower the drains.

Mr. Cohen thanked the applicant for the time put into upgrading this property. He noted that the two drive-thru lanes on the west side of the building will mean more traffic coming in the main entrance

and expressed concerns with blind spots for the customers pulling out of the drive-thru to see traffic approaching. Mr. Cohen suggested that a mirror be installed that would reflect the traffic coming in and help to avoid any incidents.

The applicant's representatives agreed to the mirror suggestion and agreed to submit a plan including the use of a mirror for administrative approval and review by the Police Department.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by M. Wachter to approve the request of Fahringer, McCarty, Grey, Inc., representing Dollar Bank/FSB to be located at 26949 Chagrin Blvd., for preliminary and final site plan approval for the addition of a drive-thru window, modifications to the parking lot, landscaping improvements, and new site lighting contingent upon: 1) compliance with the comments of the City Engineer and 2) administrative approval of a mirror on the property to improve the flow of traffic leaving the drive-thru area.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, M. Gorden, J. Greenberg, R. Hecht, B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED	

P&Z 2011-14	Ordinance 2011-63, Dollar Bank/FSB, owners of the property located at 26949 Chagrin Blvd. (PP#742-29-006) requests rezoning of the property from the current U-4A District to U-9 District. (Referred from City Council to the Planning & Zoning Commission 5/16/2011.)
-------------	---

Mr. Steve Wasserman representing Dollar Bank/FSB submitted a letter to City Council a requesting that the property located at 26949 Chagrin Blvd. be rezoned from a Class U-4A to a U-9 which will allow the owner to obtain all the attributes and benefits intended for the properties abutting I-271.

Mr. Griswold stated that the Building Department, Police Department and Fire Department have no concerns with this application.

Mr. Kreczko stated the Engineering Department would recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this is a request to rezone 1.482 acres of land located adjacent to the Chagrin Boulevard/I-271 interchange from U-4A, Integrated Business District to U-9, Motor Service District. The property was previously zoned U-9, Motor Service District, but was changed to U-4A, Integrated Business District sometime in the 1970's. The total are of the site is actually 1.7 acres, however, 0.2 acres is located in the Village of Woodmere. The site contains a three (3) story office building. Dollar Bank presently occupies the ground floor of the building with offices on the second and third floors.

Mr. Smerigan advised that banks and offices, including those presently located at 26949 Chagrin Blvd., are permitted uses in the U-9, Motor Service District. All of the other quadrants of the Chagrin Boulevard/I-271 interchange are zoned U-9, Motor Service District. Mr. Smerigan indicated that changing the subject site back to U-9, Motor Service District, would be more consistent with the City's overall zoning scheme.

Mr. Smerigan further noted that since this request involves the rezoning of property, the Commission will need to act in the form of a recommendation to City Council. Mr. Smerigan concluded by re-

commending that the Planning and Zoning Commission make a positive recommendation to City Council for the rezoning of the subject site from U-4A, Integrated Business District, to U-9, Motor Service District.

Chairperson Hecht stated that this is a housekeeping matter and is consistent with the Beachwood Codified Ordinances.

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by M. Wachter to approve and recommend to Council the request for the property located at 26949 Chagrin Blvd. (PP#7427-29-006) owned by Dollar Bank/FSB, currently zoned U-4A, Integrated Business District, to be rezoned U-9, Motor Service District, Ordinance 2011-63, to be consistent with other properties along I-271.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: C. Cohen, M. Gorden, J. Greenberg,
R. Hecht, B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell

NAYS: None

MOTION APPROVED – RECOMMEND TO
COUNCIL – 2nd reading July 18th – Public Hearing
Aug.. 15th at 7:00 p.m.

P&Z 2011-15

KA Architects, representing Pavilion Properties, Inc., located at 24055 Chagrin Blvd., is requesting preliminary and final site plan approval for site improvements.

Mr. Jim Heller from KA Architects and Mike Shemo, representative of Pavilion Properties, were present to request approval for site improvements located at 24055 Chagrin Blvd.

Mr. Heller stated that the property owner would like to improve the landscape on the property located at 24055 Chagrin Blvd. Mr. Heller indicated that in order to increase the amount of landscaping, the size of the islands will need to be enlarged and that will not be a problem even with two new tenants opening soon, and one hundred percent occupancy at the Pavilion as there has never been a time that all of the parking has been used or needed. He also indicated that many of the trees have not prospered very well. Mr. Heller presented the site improvement plan and explained that the new landscaping islands and area will have berms, there will be a layering of the plant materials within the wider islands, and there will be plants that give some color all year long. Mr. Heller indicated that in order to make this all happen the applicant is requesting a land bank variance for thirty-three (33) parking spaces. It was noted that land bank parking spaces can be re-installed at the request of the City or the applicant, if and when necessary. Mr. Heller indicated that there are other land banked spaces that are in less important areas along the side and back of the property that, if it is necessary to have immediate parking, can be made available.

Mr. Griswold stated the Fire Department, Police Department and Building Department have no concerns regarding this application.

Mr. Kreczko stated that the Engineering Department has no issues with this application.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for both preliminary and final site plan approval to implement parking lot and landscape modifications at the existing shopping center. The site plan proposes to remove existing landscaping and remove and land bank thirty-three (33) parking spaces in order to in-

crease the sizes of the landscape islands at the Chagrin Boulevard end of each of the parking aisles. New curbing will be installed to create larger landscape islands.

Mr. Smerigan continued that the existing landscape islands are narrow. As a result, it limits the applicant's ability to effectively establish and maintain plant material. By increasing the size of the landscape islands the applicant will create a more positive environment for the plant materials. The improved landscape treatments will enhance the visual quality of the shopping center at the Chagrin Boulevard end of the mall. Mr. Smerigan also noted that the applicant cannot create landscape improvements, including larger islands, without the requested parking variance.

Mr. Smerigan indicated that with the current mix of tenants, parking has not been a problem at this site. There is currently a land banked parking variance for this site. Since this is a variance, the Commission will need to act in the form of a recommendation to City Council. Should the Commission determine to grant approval, the following stipulations are suggested: 1) pursuant to Section 1159.04, it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result from the literal enforcement of the Zoning Code with regard to the provisions of Section 1121.04(b) relative to required parking, and 2) granting of a variance to Section 1121.04(b) to permit thirty-three (33) existing parking spaces to be land banked by removing said spaces and replacing them with landscaping.

Chairperson Hecht asked the applicant if there are any anticipated parking issues with the opening of Big Lots and indicated that some information on Big Lots and its operations would be helpful in understanding the parking needs of Big Lots.

Mr. Heller stated that these parking spaces that will be removed to create the landscaping are the furthest away from the retail stores and that the Center has 1,136 paved and used parking spaces.

Mr. Shemo, representative of Pavilion Properties, stated that Big Lots is a store that buys in large quantities. Merchandise revolves periodically. No merchandise is stacked in the aisles.

Chairperson Hecht asked Mr. Heller about the types of landscape materials that would be used. Will the flower portions of the landscape be all perennials or some annuals?

Mr. Heller stated that there will be canopy trees, day lilies, roses which are perennials and that there will be color year round with use of annuals also.

Mr. Cohen questioned if the parking lot would be seal coated and re-stripped and if the curb will be replaced.

Mr. Shemo stated that the parking lot will be redone and that the curbing will be replaced.

Mr. Greenberg asked about the fact that this is the first time the center has been 100% occupied and if there would be any parking problems.

Mr. Shemo stated that when the center was first expanded into a mini-mall, at that point and time it was completely occupied. There was a time when there were some empty spaces; one of the largest being the Comp USA space. There has never been any issue with not having enough parking spaces.

Mr. Smerigan stated that he would note two things with regard to the parking questions. First, Big Lots does not generate trips in the same percentage relative to the square footage as the conventional

retail stores do as items are purchased in large volume and displayed in the store. Therefore, trip generation will not be as great per square footage of the store. Secondly, if there is any problem with parking, there is the ability to order parking to be established and this can be accomplished in other areas of the shopping center.

Mr. Heller stated that there has been 141 land banked spaces that currently exist on the center property. There is an out right variance that was granted years ago of 67 parking spaces. There will be 174 total land banked parking spaces. It is again noted that the land banked spaces can be added at any time.

Mr. Cohen asked the size of the mall and Mr. Heller stated that there is a total of 237,638 square feet. Mr. Zabell asked if Mr. Heller knew the current parking ratio?

Mr. Heller stated that presently 4.5 ratio is used for shopping centers and it seems to be more than enough parking.

Mr. Zabell stated that in his experience of shopping centers, certainly 4.5 ratio per thousand is more than adequate. The composition of this shopping center, other than the grocery store, doesn't generate a high volume of people for parking.

A motion was made by M. Wachter and seconded by B. Mann to approve and recommend to Council, the request of KA Architects, representing Pavilion Properties located at 24055 Chagrin Boulevard, for preliminary and final site plan approval for site improvements with the following stipulations: 1) pursuant to Section 1159.04, it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result from the literal enforcement of the Zoning Code with regard to the provisions of Section 1121.04(b) relative to required parking, and 2) granting of a variance to Section 1121.04(b) to permit thirty-three (33) existing parking spaces to be land banked by removing said spaces and replacing them with landscaping.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: C. Cohen, M. Gorden, J. Greenberg,
R. Hecht, B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell

NAYS: None

MOTION APPROVED-RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL
MEETING JULY 18TH, 2011 – 7:00 P.M.

Other business

Chairperson Hecht stated that Menorah Park submitted the parking study and the Commission briefly discussed the study and the next steps.

Mr. Smerigan stated that there are parking issues on the campus. Menorah Park has submitted some parking study documents that suggest some actions, which would help mitigate the problem, but clearly these actions do not resolve the problems. It may be necessary to have some kind of work session with the property owner of Menorah Park Campus relative to how we proceed from this standpoint. There are some suggestions for upgrades that can be inexpensively done.

Mr. Cohen stated that Paramount Pictures have arrived in Cleveland and chose his home for some film shooting. It brought business to the hotels, restaurants, grocery stores, etc. for the City of Beachwood.

Adjournment

Rochelle Hecht, Chairperson

Sue Ley, Secretary

Karen Navolanic, Clerk of Council